

SOME CONDITIONS WHICH ALMOST CHARACTERIZE FROBENIUS GROUPS

BY
A. R. CAMINA

ABSTRACT

The main result of this paper is the following: Let G be a group with a proper non-trivial normal subgroup H such that each coset of H distinct from H is contained in a conjugacy class of G . If G is not a Frobenius group with kernel H then one of H or G/H is a p -group. The hypothesis of this theorem is shown to be equivalent to a condition on characters of G . The only group the author knows which satisfies this hypothesis and is not either Frobenius or a p -group is one of order 72.

§1. Introduction

If G is a Frobenius group with kernel H the irreducible characters of G can be divided into two families, those with H in the kernel and those for which H is not in the kernel. Let us label the second set χ_1, χ_n . Each χ_i is induced from a character, say, ξ_i of H and χ_i , when restricted to H , is the sum of the conjugates of ξ_i , see [1]. So each χ_i vanishes on $G \setminus H$ and there exists a set of integers α_i , $i = 1, \dots, n$ such that $\sum_{i=1}^n \alpha_i \chi_i$ is constant ($= -1$) on H^* . We extract these ideas as

HYPOTHESIS (F1). G is a finite group with a proper normal subgroup $H \neq 1$ and a set of irreducible non-trivial characters of G , χ_1, \dots, χ_n , where n is a natural number, such that

- (a) χ_i vanishes on $G \setminus H$ and
- (b) there exist natural numbers $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_n > 0$ such that $\sum_{i=1}^n \alpha_i \chi_i$ is constant on H^* .

Another property enjoyed by Frobenius groups is: if x is in $G \setminus H$ then xy is conjugate to x for all y in H .

Received December 16, 1977 and in revised form May 23, 1978

HYPOTHESIS (F2). G is a finite group with a proper normal subgroup $H \neq 1$ such that if $x \in G \setminus H$, x is conjugate to $xy \ \forall y \in H$.

The first result is the following:

THEOREM 1. G satisfies hypothesis (F1) if and only if G satisfies hypothesis (F2).

This result will be proved in §3. In §2 we investigate some properties of groups satisfying (F2). We prove a result which when combined with Theorem 1 leads to the following theorem:

THEOREM 2. Let G be a group satisfying (F2) (or (F1)) then G satisfies one of the following conditions:

- (i) G is a Frobenius group with kernel H ,
- (ii) H is a p -group for some prime p , or
- (iii) G/H is a p -group for some prime p .

It is not too difficult to show that if H and $[G:H]$ have coprime orders and G satisfies (F2) then G is a Frobenius group with kernel H . Thus the main argument is to force either H or G/H to be a p -group if G is not Frobenius. There are certainly p -groups G satisfying these hypotheses, e.g. extra-special groups. May I thank Ian D. Macdonald for pointing out to me that a number of simple thoughts on p -groups with this structure turned out to be false. The only example the author knows where G/H is a p -group and H is not, is when G has order 72 and is the Frobenius group which has kernel of order 9 and the complement is quaternion of order 8. We choose H to be the group of order 18. If x is any element of order 4 in G , x has 18 conjugates, and since x is conjugate to x^{-1} and Hx contains x^{-1} we can see that Hx is precisely the conjugacy class of x . One can see from the discussion in §2 that it is, unfortunately, not possible to use this argument for Frobenius groups unless the complement is a 2-group. We comment here that since Hx contains only elements of the same order as x the results of Hughes Kegel Thompson [1, V §8] play an important role.

In the situation where H is a p -group we can investigate the structure of $G/C_G(H/H_0)$ where H/H_0 is a chief factor of G . This action has the property that any non-trivial p' -element acts fixed-point-freely on H/H_0 . We can also observe that $C_G(H/H_0)$ is precisely $O_p(G)$ since no p' -element of G can centralize H/H_0 . Using some of the more recent classification theorems and p -modular representations of known groups W. B. Stewart [2] has been able to classify the possible modules and groups which can occur as $G/O_p(G)$. Using this result we have the following:

COROLLARY. *Let G satisfy (F2) and assume G is not a soluble group nor is G Frobenius. If H is a p -group then $G/O_p(G) = \bar{G}$ has a normal subgroup \bar{K} such that \bar{G}/\bar{K} is soluble and*

- (a) if $p = 2$ then $\bar{K} \cong \text{SL}(2, 2^n), \text{Sz}(2^{2m+1})$ or $\text{SL}(2, 2^n) \times \text{Sz}(2^{2mb})$,
- (b) if $p = 3$ then $\bar{K} \cong \text{SL}(2, 3^n), \text{SL}(2, 5), \text{SL}(2, 7)$ or $\text{SL}(2, 17)$,
- (c) if $p \geq 5$ then $\bar{K} \cong \text{SL}(2, p^n)$.

If one refers to W. B. Stewart [2] then more information can be obtained both as to the nature of the possible modules on which these groups act as well as the structure of \bar{G}/\bar{K} .

In the case where G/H is a p -group the author has been able to make limited progress, certainly none to warrant mentioning, although there is an overlap with some work on groups of “central type”. A group G has been called a group of central type if it contains an irreducible character whose degree when squared equals $[G : Z(G)]$. For some results in this topic and a good bibliography the reader is referred to R. Merris (J. Res. Nat. Bur. Standards Sect. B, **80B** (1976), 259).

The author would like to thank the referee for his helpful comments.

§2. Groups satisfying (F2)

In this section we consider a group G satisfying (F2). We prove a number of lemmas about such a group under this hypothesis leading up to a proof of Theorem 2.

LEMMA 1. *Let $x \in G$ but $x \notin H$. Let $\bar{}$ denote the homomorphism from G to G/H . Then*

$$|C_G(x)| = |C_{\bar{G}}(\bar{x})|.$$

PROOF. Since each coset of H which is not H is contained in a conjugacy class, any conjugacy class not contained in H is a union of cosets of H . If Hu and Hv are in the same conjugacy class, u and v are conjugate, in particular \bar{u} and \bar{v} are conjugate in \bar{G} . Similarly if \bar{u} and \bar{v} are conjugate in \bar{G} , Hu and Hv are in the same conjugacy class. Hence $[G : C_G(x)] = [G : C_{\bar{G}}(\bar{x})] \cdot |H|$.

Thus $|G|/|C_G(x)| = |G|/|C_{\bar{G}}(\bar{x})|$ and so $|C_G(x)| = |C_{\bar{G}}(\bar{x})|$ as required.

LEMMA 2. *If x is not in H and has order m and $y \in C_H(x)$ then the order of y divides m .*

PROOF. xy has order m and so $x^m y^m = 1$ and so $y^m = 1$.

LEMMA 3. *If x is not in H and has order m modulo H and $y \in C_H(x)$ such that y has prime order p say, then p divides m , where $m \neq 1$.*

PROOF. We prove this by showing that the order of x is only divisible by primes dividing m . Assume x has order divisible by precisely p^e where $e \geq 1$ and p does not divide m . Then $x = uv$ where u has order prime to p , v has order p^e and $[u, v] = 1$. Now $x^m = u^m v^m$ and so $v^m = x^m (u^m)^{-1}$ but $x^m \in H$. This implies that v^m and u^m have the same order or that v^m and u^m are both in H . However v^m and u^m have coprime orders (not both 1) and so v^m and u^m are in H . Now as m and p are coprime we know that $v \in H$. But $[v, u] = 1$ and v has order coprime to u contradicting Lemma 2. We can now complete the argument since if y centralizes x and y has order p , p divides the order of x by Lemma 2 and so p divides m .

LEMMA 4. *If there is an element of prime order not in H then H is nilpotent.*

PROOF. This is a direct consequence of the theorem due to Hughes Thompson Kegel [1; V §8].

PROPOSITION 1. *If H and G/H are of coprime order then G is a Frobenius group with kernel H .*

PROOF. Now we know by Lemma 3 that if $y \in H$, $C_G(y) \subseteq H$. Also by Lemma 4 we have that H is nilpotent. Using the result of Schur-Zassenhaus [1; I §18] we have a complement to H and now it is easy to see that G is a Frobenius group.

LEMMA 5. *If there is an element x of G which has order pq modulo H where p and q are distinct primes then H is nilpotent.*

PROOF. By Lemma 3, $C_H(x^p)$ is a q -group and $C_H(x^q)$ is a p -group. So $C_H(x^p) \cap C_H(x^q) = 1 \supseteq C_H(x)$. So $x^{pq} = 1$ since $x^{pq} \in C_H(x)$. Thus x^p is an element of prime order not in H and so by Lemma 4, H is nilpotent.

We can now turn our attention to the structure of the Sylow subgroups of G . A simple application of Lemma 1 enables us to prove

LEMMA 6. *If P is a Sylow p -subgroup of G and there is an $x \in P$ such that $x \notin H$ and $C_P(x) \cdot (H \cap P) = P$ then $P \cap H = 1$.*

PROOF. Since $|C_G(x)| = |C_G(\bar{x})|$ where $\bar{}$ denotes the homomorphism from G to G/H , a Sylow p -group of $C_G(x)$ has order at most $[P: H \cap P]$. Since $C_{H \cap P}(x) \neq 1$ when $H \cap P \neq 1$ we have a contradiction if $C_P(x) \cdot (H \cap P) = P$.

LEMMA 7. *Let p be a prime which divides the order of H and $[G : H]$. Let P be a Sylow p -subgroup of G then $P/P \cap H$ contains an elementary Abelian subgroup of order p^2 .*

PROOF. If $P/P \cap H$ does not satisfy the conclusions of the lemma then $P/P \cap H$ is cyclic or generalized quaternion [1; III §8]. If $P/P \cap H$ is cyclic and $x(P \cap H)$ is a generator for $P/P \cap H$ then $C_p(x) \cdot (P \cap H) = P$ which is false by Lemma 6. Hence we may assume that $P/P \cap H$ is a generalized quaternion group of order say 2^a .

Let $x(P \cap H)$ be an element of order 2^{a-1} . Then $x^{2^{a-2}} = z$ is such that $z^2 \in H$ and $C_{P/P \cap H}(zH) = P/P \cap H$. Also $|C_P(z)| \geq 2^{a-1}$ since $|\langle x \rangle| \geq 2^{a-1}$. By Lemma 1, $|C_P(z)| = 2^a$ or 2^{a-1} but as $|C_{P \cap H}(z)| \neq 1$ we know that $|C_P(z)| = 2^a$. If $z^2 \neq 1$, $|\langle z \rangle| > 2^a$ and $C_P(z) = \langle x \rangle$ and $z^4 = 1$ with $\langle z^2 \rangle = Z(P)$. As G is an (F2)-group there exists $s \in G$ such that $x^s = xz^2$. Then $(x^2)^s = x^2$ and $(x)^{s^2} = (xz^2)^s = xz^4 = x$. Thus s is a 2-power element which centralizes z and hence is in $\langle x \rangle$. This contradicts the original definition of s .

Thus we have that $z^2 = 1$. Then every element of $(P \cap H)z$ has order 2 and z inverts $P \cap H$ which is therefore Abelian. Since $|C_{P \cap H}(z)| = 2$, $P \cap H$ now has at most one involution and so is cyclic. If $|P \cap H| > 2$, $P/C_P(P \cap H)$ is Abelian but $C_P(P \cap H) = P \cap H$ which is a contradiction. So $|P \cap H| = 2$ but now since the Schur multiplier of a quaternion group is trivial [1; V §25] we can assume z is central in P which by Lemma 6 is false.

We can now complete this section by proving

PROPOSITION 2. *Let G be a group satisfying (F2). Then either (i) G is a Frobenius group or (ii) H is a group of prime power order or (iii) G/H is a group of prime power order.*

PROOF. By Lemma 5, H is nilpotent unless all elements of G/H have prime power order. We also know that if a prime p does not divide the order of H and does divide the order of G , H is nilpotent by Lemma 4. Thus if H is not nilpotent and P is a Sylow p -subgroup of G then $P \cap H \neq 1$. Assume now that H is not nilpotent and let M/H be a minimal normal subgroup of G/H . Assume M/H is an elementary Abelian subgroup and G/H is not a group of prime power order. If p is a prime which does not divide the order of M/H but does divide $[G : H]$ then $P/P \cap H$ acts fixed-point freely on M/H , where P is a Sylow p -group of G . Hence $P/P \cap H$ has no elementary Abelian subgroup of order p^2 . This contradicts Lemma 7.

If M/H is a non-Abelian subgroup we have by M. Suzuki [3] that M/H is

isomorphic to one of $PSL(2,5)$, $PSL(2,7)$, $PSL(2,9)$, $PSL(2,17)$, $PSL(3,4)$, $Sz(8)$ or $Sz(32)$. Hence G/H is one of these groups extended by a subgroup of its automorphism group. But in all cases G/H has a cyclic Sylow p -subgroup for some prime p and this is again false.

So we may now assume that H is nilpotent or $[G:H]$ is a prime power. To prove the proposition we need only show that if H satisfies neither (ii) nor (iii) then it is a Frobenius group. By Proposition 1 we can assume there is a prime p such that if P is a Sylow p -subgroup of G , neither $P/P \cap H$ nor $P \cap H$ are trivial. Let R be a Sylow subgroup of H distinct from P . Then $N_G(R) \supseteq P$ and $C_G(R) \supseteq P \cap H$. Hence $P/P \cap H$ acts fixed-point freely on R and this contradicts Lemma 7.

§3. Proof of Theorem 1

Assume that G satisfies (F1). Let $|G| = g$ and $|H| = h$. We consider the equation $(\sum \alpha_i \chi_i, \chi_j) = \alpha_j$.

$$\therefore \alpha_j = \frac{1}{g} \left(\sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) \chi_j(1) + c \sum_{x \in H^*} \overline{\chi_j(x)} \right) \quad \text{where } c = \sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(x),$$

$$\therefore g\alpha_j = \left(\sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) \right) \chi_j(1) - c\chi_j(1) + c \sum_{x \in G} \overline{\chi_j(x)},$$

(1) $\therefore g\alpha_j = \chi_j(1) \left(\left(\sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) \right) - c \right),$

$$\therefore g = (\chi_j(1)/\alpha_j) \left\{ \sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) - c \right\}.$$

$$\therefore 0 = (\chi_j(1)/\alpha_j - \chi_k(1)/\alpha_k) \cdot \left(\left\{ \sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) \right\} - c \right)$$

for all pairs $1 \leq j \neq k \leq n$.

Since $g \neq 0$ we have that

(2) $\chi_j(1)/\alpha_j = \chi_k(1)/\alpha_k = f \quad \text{say } \forall j, k.$

Consider the equation $(\sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i, 1_G) = 0,$

(3) $\therefore 0 = \left(\sum_i \alpha_i \chi_i(1) \right) + (h-1)c.$

Combining (1), (2) and (3) we obtain

$$g = f \left(\left(\sum_i \alpha_i^2 f \right) + \left(\sum_i \alpha_i^2 f \right) / (h - 1) \right).$$

If we put $\Sigma \alpha_i^2 = m$ we have

$$g = mf^2(1 + 1/(h - 1))$$

$$\therefore g = mf^2h/(h - 1).$$

Let $\theta_1 \cdots \theta_r$ be the remaining irreducible characters of G . Then

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \chi_i(1)^2 + \sum_{i=1}^r \theta_i^2(1) = g,$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^r \theta_i^2(1) = g - \sum_{i=1}^n \alpha_i^2 \cdot (g(h - 1))/(mh),$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^r \theta_i^2(1) = g - \frac{g(h - 1)}{mh} \cdot m = g/h.$$

Now since H is normal in G there exist characters of G which contain H in their kernel and the sum of the squares of their degrees equals g/h . Hence these plus the χ_1, \dots, χ_n are all the characters of G . Now let $x \in G \setminus H$ and let $y \in H$. Then xy is not in H . For a character $\chi_i, \chi_i(x) = \chi_i(xy) = 0$. For a character $\theta_i, \theta_i(x) = \theta_i(xH) = \theta_i(xy)$. Thus x and xy have the same character values for all the characters of G and hence are conjugate [1].

We now assume that G satisfies (F2). Let $\theta_1, \dots, \theta_r$ be the irreducible characters of G with H in the kernel and χ_1, \dots, χ_n be the remaining characters. Thus $|C_G(x)| = \sum_{i=1}^r |\theta_i(x)|^2 + \sum_{i=1}^n |\chi_i(x)|^2$. Also

$$|C_{G/H}(xH)| = \sum_{i=1}^r |\theta_i(xH)|^2 = \sum_{i=1}^r |\theta_i(x)|^2 = |C_G(x)|$$

by Lemma 1: So $\sum_{i=1}^n |\chi_i(x)|^2 = 0$ and thus $\chi_i(x) = 0, i = 1, \dots, n$ and this is true for all x not in H .

Consider the character χ_i for some $i, 1 \leq i \leq n$. There exists an irreducible character ξ_i of H and a natural number e_i such that $\chi_i|_H = e_i \Sigma \xi_i^u$ where u runs over a system of coset representatives for the stabilizer of ξ_i . If $j \neq i$ the irreducible characters of H involved in $\chi_j|_H$ are disjoint from those involved with χ_i for otherwise $\chi_j|_H$ would be a multiple of $\chi_i|_H$. But since χ_i and χ_j vanish outside H, χ_j would be a multiple of χ_i and that is false. Let η be any non-trivial irreducible character of H . Then

$$(\eta^G, \theta_i)_G = (\eta, \theta_i|_H)_H = (\eta, \theta, (1), 1_H) = 0, \quad i = 1, 2, \dots, r.$$

Thus η^G involves a character of the form χ_i .

Let $e = \text{l.c.m.}(e_i: 1 \leq i \leq n)$. So we have

$$\left(\sum_{i=1}^n (e/e_i)\xi_i(1)\chi_i \right)_H = e\rho_H - e1_H$$

where ρ_H is the regular character of H . Hence with $\alpha_i = (e/e_i)\xi_i(1)$

$$\sum_{i=1}^n \alpha_i \chi_i \quad \text{is constant on } H.$$

Thus G satisfies (F1) and this completes the proof of Theorem 1.

REFERENCES

1. B. Huppert, *Endliche Gruppen I*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg-New York, 1967.
2. W. B. Stewart, *Largely fixed-point-free groups*, to appear.
3. M. Suzuki, *On a class of doubly transitive groups*, Ann. of Math. (2) **75** (1962), 105-145.

SCHOOL OF MATHEMATICS AND PHYSICS
UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA
NORWICH, ENGLAND